Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

Yu Cao

SID: 52640130

Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

24 April, 2015

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト

- ∢ ⊒ →

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

Table of contents



2 Transition Path Theory (TPT)

3 Some Simple Applications of TPT



Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

<ロ> (四) (四) (三) (三)

Outline for Section 1

- Introduction of Rare Events
 - Background
 - Transition Problem
- 2 Transition Path Theory (TPT)
- 3 Some Simple Applications of TPT
- 4 Summary and Outlook

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

Historical Background

Escape rate (Hoff and Arrhenius):

$$k = \nu \exp\left(-\frac{1}{k_B T}E\right) = \nu \exp\left(-\beta E\right)$$
(1)

where ν is the prefactor, k_B is the Boltzmann constant, T is the temperature and E is the energy barrier, $\beta = \frac{1}{k_B T} T^1$.

¹Hänggi et al. (1990).

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

Mean transition time:

$$\overline{t} \propto \frac{1}{k} \propto \exp\left(\frac{1}{k_B T} E\right),$$
(2)

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

which is exponentially large at small T (e.g. let $T \rightarrow 0^+$).

Rare event

The extremely low probability and long transition time of events is where the term *rare event* comes from.

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Meaning

Rare event has little probability of occurrence, but it has large impact once it happens. For instance,

- formation of cancer;
- virus spreading;
- system failure, e.g. breaking down of materials;
- many others...

Therefore, one of the meanings of studying rare events is perhaps to understand the mechanics of dynamical systems so as to control risk.

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References



Background Transition Problem

- Complex dynamical system such as protein folding process²;
- High degree of freedom;
- Expensive computational cost in direct simulation, even for small systems.

²Noé et al. (2009).

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

() < </p>

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

List of Methods

- Transition State Theory (TST): classical method;
- 2 Large Deviation Principle (LDP): consider the vanishing noise case³;
- Transition Path Sampling (TPS);
- Transition Path Theory (TPT): study statistics of ensemble reactive trajectories;
- 🧿 et al...

³Freidlin and Wentzell (2012).

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Background Transition Problem

Transition Problem

For an ergodic stochastic dynamical system $\{X_t\}_{t \in T}$ on state space *S*, we prescribe two disjoint subsets *A* and *B* of *S*:

- set A is the set where transition starts;
- set B is the set where transition ends.

In applications:

- (chemical kinetics): A is the reactant state, B is the product state;
- (biology): A is the health state, B is the body condition with cancer;

・ロン ・回 と ・ ヨ と ・ ヨ と

- (system control): A is the normal state, B is the failure state;
- et al...

Transition Path Theory (TPT) Some Simple Applications of TPT Summary and Outlook References

Background Transition Problem

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Transition Problem

Definition (Reactive trajectory)

Reactive trajectory is a path starts from A directly to B without returning to A first.

For instance, state space $S = \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$, $A = \{1\}$, $B = \{4\}$, then

- $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 4$ is a reactive trajectory;
- $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 4$ is not.

Background Transition Problem

イロト イポト イラト イラト

Transition Problem

Here is a list of questions of interest:

- What is the transition rate k^{AB} ?
- What is the most probable exit point in set A and what is the most probable entering point in set B?
- I How to get insight into transition mechanics?
- Which is the path that dominates among all the transition paths, i.e. Most Probable Exit Path (MPEP)?

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Outline for Section 2

- Introduction of Rare Events
- 2 Transition Path Theory (TPT)
 - Introduction
 - General Definitions
 - Diffusion Process
 - Markov Chains

3 Some Simple Applications of TPT

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

イロト イポト イラト イラト

Introduction of TPT

- Firstly proposed by E and vanden Eijnden (2006);
- Studying object: transition in ergodic stochastic dynamical system;
- Ssumption: ergodicity and strong Markov property in the system;
- Advantage: no assumption on time-reversibility (sometimes called detailed balance); no assumption on the structure of set A and B.

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Frontier Application

- Lennard-Jones cluster LJ_{38}^4 ;
- Onformation changes in trialanine⁵;
- O Protein folding process⁶;
- many others...

⁴Cameron and Vanden-Eijnden (2014).
⁵Metzner et al. (2009).
⁶Noé et al. (2009).

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Rare Event in Stochastic Systems

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

General Definitions

Definition (Hitting time)

1 If $T = \mathbb{R}$, define hitting times as follow:

$$t^{AB,+}(t) := \inf\{s \ge t : X_s \in A \cup B\},\$$

$$t^{AB,-}(t) := \sup\{s \le t : X_s \in A \cup B\}.$$

2 If $T = \mathbb{Z}$, define hitting times as follow:

$$t^{AB,+}(n) := \inf\{m \ge n : X_m \in A \cup B\},\$$

$$t^{AB,-}(n) := \sup\{m \le n : X_m \in A \cup B\}.$$

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Committor Functions

Definition (Forward committor functions $q^+(x)$)

The forward committor function $S \rightarrow [0, 1]$, is defined as the probability of going to set *B* before reaching set *A*:

$$q^+(x) := \mathbb{P}_x[X_{t^{AB,+}(0)} \in B].$$

Definition (Backward committor function $q^{-}(x)$)

The backward committor function $S \rightarrow [0, 1]$, is defined as the probability of coming from set A instead of set B:

$$q^{-}(x) := \mathbb{P}_{x}[X_{t^{AB,-}(0)} \in A].$$

・ロン ・回と ・ヨン ・ヨン

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Diffusion Process

We consider the following stochastic differential equation:

$$\dot{X}_t = b(X_t) + \sqrt{2D(X_t)} dW_t \tag{3}$$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

where $X_t \in \mathbb{R}^d$, drift term $b : \mathbb{R}^d \to \mathbb{R}^d$, diffusion tensor $D : \mathbb{R}^d \to \mathbb{R}^d \times \mathbb{R}^d$, W_t is the Weiner process (Brownian motion).

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Diffusion Process

The forward infinitesimal generator ${\mathcal L}$ takes the form of

$$\mathcal{L}f = b \cdot \nabla f + a : \nabla \nabla f, \tag{4}$$

and the generator for time-reversed process takes the form of

$$\mathcal{L}^{-}f = -b \cdot \nabla f + \frac{2}{m} \operatorname{div}(am) \cdot \nabla f + a : \nabla \nabla f.$$
(5)

・ロト ・日本 ・モート ・モート

where $a := \sqrt{D}\sqrt{D}^T$ and *m* is the probability density at equilibrium.

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Probability Density at Equilibrium and Probability Current

Fokker-Planck equation gives:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}p(x,t) = -\nabla \cdot (b(x)p(x,t) - \operatorname{div}(a(x)p(x,t))).$$
(6)

Definition (Probability current)

Probability current J(x, t) := b(x)p(x, t) - div(a(x)p(x, t)).

The probability density function at equilibrium m(x) satisfies:

$$0 = -\nabla \cdot (b(x)m(x) - \operatorname{div}(a(x)m(x))). \tag{7}$$

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Reactive Trajectories

We want to extract all the reactive trajectories for a sample path $\omega \in \Omega$, stored in terms of their first exit time in A, denoted by t_n^A and first passage time to B, denoted by t_n^B .

Definition (Ensemble of Reactive Trajectory)

The set of reactive trajectories is described by $R := \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{Z}} (t_n^A, t_n^B)$.

Define

$$\mathbf{1}_{R}(t) := \mathbf{1}_{A}(X_{t^{AB,-}(t)})\mathbf{1}_{B}(X_{t^{AB,+}(t)}),$$

・ロト ・日本 ・モート ・モート

which describes whether the system is in the process of transition.

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Committor Functions

Committor functions satisfy the backward Kolmogorov equation:

$$\begin{cases} \mathcal{L}q^{+}(x) = 0 \\ q^{+}(x) \mid_{x \in A} = 0 \quad q^{+}(x) \mid_{x \in B} = 1 \end{cases}$$
(8)

and

$$\begin{cases} \mathcal{L}^{-}q^{-}(x) = 0 \\ q^{-}(x) \mid_{x \in A} = 1 \quad q^{-}(x) \mid_{x \in B} = 0 \end{cases}$$
(9)

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

The Distribution of Reactive Trajectories

The probability density $m^{AB}(x)$, which serves as the measure of distribution of reactive trajectories, satisfies:

$$m^{AB}(x) = q^{+}(x)q^{-}(x)m(x)/Z^{AB},$$
 (10)

where Z^{AB} is the factor for normalization.

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Reactive Probability Flux

We want to find $J^{AB}(x)$ so that for any surface $E \subset S \setminus (A \cup B)$ (its enclosed space is E_a)

$$\int_{E} J^{AB}(x) \cdot \hat{n}(x) \ d\sigma(x) =$$

$$\lim_{s \to 0} \frac{1}{s} \lim_{T \to \infty} \frac{1}{2T} \int_{-T}^{T} [\mathbf{1}_{E_{a}}(X(t))\mathbf{1}_{S \setminus E_{a}}(X(t+s)) - \mathbf{1}_{S \setminus E_{a}}(X(t+s))]\mathbf{1}_{R}(t) \ dt.$$
(11)

Under ergodicity and strong Markov property, we can derive that

$$J^{AB} = q^- q^+ J + q^- ma \nabla q^+ - q^+ ma \nabla q^-.$$
⁽¹²⁾

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Transition Rate and Mean Transition Time

For any surface $E \subset S \setminus (A \cup B)$,

$$k^{AB} = \int_{E} J^{AB}(x) \cdot \hat{n}(x) \, d\sigma(x), \qquad (13)$$

which is the same for any *E*, due to the fact that $\nabla \cdot J^{AB}(x) = 0$ for $x \notin A \cup B$.

Mean transition time

$$\bar{t}^{AB} := \lim_{T \to \infty} \frac{1}{N_T} \int_{-T}^{T} \mathbf{1}_{S \setminus (A \cup B)}(X(t)) \mathbf{1}_R(t) \ dt = \frac{Z^{AB}}{k^{AB}}, \qquad (14)$$

where N_T means the number of reactive trajectories in time period [-T, T].

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Most Probable Exit and Entering Position

Most probable exit position in set A, denoted by x_1^* , is defined by

$$x_1^* := rg \max_{x \in A} J^{AB}(x) \cdot \hat{n}(x).$$

Here $\hat{n}(x)$ is pointing outward of ∂A .

Most probable entering position in set *B*, denoted by x_2^* , is defined by

$$x_2^* := \arg \max_{x \in B} J^{AB}(x) \cdot \hat{n}(x).$$

Here $\hat{n}(x)$ is pointing inward of ∂B .

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Markov Chain

We shall consider an ergodic Markov Chain.

- Without loss of generality, we might as well let $S = \mathbb{N}^+$.
- The time parameter $T = \mathbb{Z}$.
- The one-step transition matrix is denoted by P.
- Infinitesimal generator $\mathcal{L} := P I$.
- The generator for reversed process is denoted by \mathcal{L}^- , which has the form of π .

$$\mathcal{L}_{ij}^{-} = \frac{\pi_j}{\pi_i} \mathcal{L}_{ji}.$$
 (15)

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Reactive Trajectories

Similarly, define the collection of reactive trajectories R by

$$R:=\cup_{n\in\mathbb{Z}}[t_n^A,t_n^B],$$

where sample path X_n is in the process of A-B transition iff $t_n^A \le n \le t_n^B$. Similarly, define $\mathbf{1}_R(n) := \mathbf{1}_A(X_{t^{AB,-}(n)})\mathbf{1}_B(X_{t^{AB,+}(n+1)}).$

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Committor Functions

For forward committor function $q^+(x)$, $q_i^+ := q^+(i) = 1$ if $i \in B$; $q_i^+ = 0$ if $i \in A$. For $i \notin A \cup B$,

$$(\mathcal{L}q^+)_i = \sum_{j \in S} \mathcal{L}_{ij} q_j^+ = 0.$$
⁽¹⁶⁾

For backward committor function q^- , $q_i^- := q^-(i) = 1$ if $i \in A$; $q_i^- = 0$ if $i \in B$. For $i \notin (A \cup B)$,

$$(\mathcal{L}^{-}q^{-})_{i} = \sum_{j \in S} \mathcal{L}_{ij}^{-}q_{j}^{-} = 0.$$
 (17)

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Probability Distribution of Reactive Trajectories

The probability distribution of reactive trajectories, defined on space $S \setminus (A \cup B)$, is denoted by $m^{AB}(\cdot)$. It takes the following form after derivation:

$$m^{AB}(i) = q_i^- \pi_i q_i^+ / Z^{AB}, \qquad \forall i \in S \setminus (A \cup B),$$
(18)

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

where $Z^{AB} := \sum_{i \in S} q_i^- \pi_i q_i^+ < 1.$

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Reactive Probability Current

Reactive probability current, denoted by J_{ij}^{AB} , is introduced to depict the contribution of jump between any two states *i* and *j* to the whole reactive trajectories: for $i \neq j$,

$$J_{ij}^{AB} = J^{AB}(i,j) := \lim_{T \to \infty} \frac{1}{2T+1} \sum_{n=-T}^{T} \mathbf{1}_{\{i\}}(X_n) \mathbf{1}_{\{j\}}(X_{n+1}) \mathbf{1}_R(n)$$

$$= q_i^- \pi_i P_{ij} q_j^+ = q_i^- \pi_i L_{ij} q_j^+.$$
(19)

Set $J_{ii}^{AB} = 0, \forall i \in S$.

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Transition Rate and Mean Transition Time

The transition rate k^{AB} is the frequency of occurrence of complete transition from set A to B,

$$k^{AB} := \lim_{T \to \infty} \frac{1}{2T+1} \sum_{n=-T}^{T} \mathbf{1}_{A}(X_{n}) \mathbf{1}_{S \setminus A}(X_{n+1}) \mathbf{1}_{R}(n)$$
$$= \sum_{i \in A, j \notin A} J_{ij}^{AB} = \sum_{i \in A, j \in S} J_{ij}^{AB},$$
(20)

Similarly, we might derive that the mean transition time \bar{t}^{AB} is

$$\bar{t}^{AB} = 1 + \frac{Z^{AB}}{k^{AB}}.$$
(21)

・ロン ・回 と ・ ヨ と ・ ヨ と

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Most Probable Exit and Entering Position

In Markov chain, the most probable exit position i^* in set A could be defined as the position, out of which the total reactive probability current achieves the maximum value among all:

$$i^* = \arg \max_{i \in A} \lim_{T \to \infty} \frac{1}{2T+1} \sum_{n=-T}^{T} \mathbf{1}_{\{i\}}(X_n) \mathbf{1}_R(n)$$

= $\arg \max_{i \in A} \sum_{i \in S} J_{ij}^{AB}.$

Similarly, the most probable entering position j^* into set B is

$$j^* = \arg \max_{j \in B} \sum_{i \in S} J_{ij}^{AB}.$$

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

Representative Dominant Transition Path

In the paper written by Metzner et al. (2009), representative dominant transition path is proposed as the path through which the reactive probability current achieves the maximum value among all.

From network flow J^{AB} , we could generate another network representing its net flow: the effective probability current J_{ii}^+ is defined as

$$J_{ij}^{+} := \max(J_{ij}^{AB} - J_{ji}^{AB}, 0).$$
(22)

・ロト ・日本 ・モート ・モート

Introduction General Definitions Diffusion Process Markov Chains

The capacity of a path $\varphi = (\varphi_0, \varphi_1, \cdots, \varphi_n)$ is limited by the weight of its bottleneck, which is defined as

$$(b_1, b_2) = \arg\min_{e=(i,j)\in\varphi} J_{ij}^+.$$
(23)

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Definition (Representative dominant transition path (informal))

Representative dominant transition path is defined as the simple A-B transition path whose bottleneck has the highest weight.

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

Outline for Section 3

- Introduction of Rare Events
- 2 Transition Path Theory (TPT)

3 Some Simple Applications of TPT

- Double-well Potential
- Triple-well Potential
- Markov Chains

Summary and Outlook

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

Double-well Potential

Let $b(x) = -\nabla V(x)$ and $D = \sigma^2 I$, where $V(x) = V(x_1, x_2) = \frac{5}{2}(x_1^2 - 1)^2 + 5x_2^2$ and I is the identity matrix.



Figure: Potential $V(x_1, x_2)$.

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

There are two local minima $(\pm 1, 0)$ and a saddle point (0, 0).

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: Probability density m(x) at equilibrium.

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



(a) Forward committor function q^+ . (b) Backward committor function q^- .

Figure: Committor functions.

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

3

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: Probability density of reactive trajectories $m^{AB}(x)$.

æ

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: The vector field J^{AB} . Set A is colored in gray; set B is colored in black.

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト

- E

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

æ

Triple-well Potential

Change b(x) to be $-\nabla V(x)$ where

$$V(x_1, x_2) = 3 \exp \left(-x_1^2 - (x_2 - 1/3)^2\right) - 3 \exp \left(-x_1^2 - (x_2 - 5/3)^2\right) - 5 \exp \left(-(x_1 - 1)^2 - x_2^2\right) - 5 \exp \left(-(x_1 + 1)^2 - x_2^2\right) + 0.2x_1^4 + 0.2(x_2 - 1/3)^4.$$

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: Potential $V(x_1, x_2)$. Set A is colored in light gray, set B in dark gray.

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆臣 > ◆臣 > ○

æ

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: Probability density of reactive trajectories $m^{AB}(x)$ under different noise σ .

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

3

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains



Figure: Probability flux $J^{AB}(x)$ under different noise σ .

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

æ

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

Markov Chains

Consider a randomly generated Markov Chain $\{X_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{Z}}$ with state space $S = \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$ as an example. Let $A = \{1\}$ and $B = \{4\}$.

$$P = \begin{bmatrix} 0.4539 & 0.2906 & 0.1907 & 0.0648 \\ 0.3537 & 0.4600 & 0.0362 & 0.1501 \\ 0.5584 & 0.0211 & 0.3236 & 0.0968 \\ 0.1737 & 0.5098 & 0.1597 & 0.1568 \end{bmatrix}$$

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

Probability current J^{AB} is

$$J^{AB} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0.0341 & 0.0118 & 0.0264 \\ 0 & 0 & 0.0012 & 0.0337 \\ 0 & 0.0008 & 0 & 0.0123 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

while effective probability current J^+ is

$$J^{+} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0.0341 & 0.0118 & 0.0264 \\ 0 & 0 & 0.0005 & 0.0337 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0.0123 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Double-well Potential Triple-well Potential Markov Chains

★ E > < E >

æ



Representative dominant transition path $\varphi^* = (1, 2, 4)$.

Outline for Section 4

Introduction of Rare Events

2 Transition Path Theory (TPT)

3 Some Simple Applications of TPT





- Transition path theory provides us with a new perspective to consider the ensemble behavior of reactive trajectories, different from classical methods such as TST, LDP, large fluctuation.
- The advantage of TPT is that many statistics can be computed and the assumption in TPT is weak.
- Weakness of TPT: cannot handle high-dimensional problem directly, due to its cost in solving committor functions.

イロト イポト イラト イラト

Outlook and Further Work

- How to reduce the computational cost in solving committor function?
- How to perform local analysis on the operator \mathcal{L} so that the computational cost might be reduced?
- How representative is the representative dominant transition path in e.g. real physical and biological system?

イロト イポト イラト イラト

Cameron, M. and E. Vanden-Eijnden (2014). Flows in complex networks: Theory, algorithms, and application to lennardjones cluster rearrangement. *Journal of Statistical Physics* 156(3), 427–454.

- E, W. and E. vanden Eijnden (2006). Towards a theory of transition paths. *Journal of Statistical Physics 123*(3), 503–523.
- Freidlin, M. I. and A. D. Wentzell (2012). *Random Perturbations of Dynamical Systems*. Springer-Verlag.
- Hänggi, P., P. Talkner, and M. Borkovec (1990, Apr). Reaction-rate theory: fifty years after kramers. *Rev. Mod. Phys. 62*, 251–341.
- Metzner, P., C. Schütte, and E. Vanden-Eijnden (2009, January). Transition path theory for markov jump processes. *Multiscale Model. Simul.* 7(3), 11921219.
- Noé, F., C. Schütte, E. Vanden-Eijnden, L. Reich, and T. R. Weikl (2009). Constructing the equilibrium ensemble of folding pathways from short off-equilibrium simulations. *Proceedings of the National*

Yu Cao SID: 52640130 Supervisor: Dr Xiang Zhou

Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 106(45), 1901119016.

イロン イヨン イヨン イヨン

æ